

Explanation of The Book of Tawheed

Class Notes – Chapter 44

بَابُ قَوْلٍ: (مَا شَاءَ اللَّهُ وَشِئْتُمْ)

Saying: 'By the will of Allah and yours'.

- **Relevance of the chapter to the book:** This chapter is an extension of Chapter 42 (*Do not set up rivals to Allah in worship*). The author specifically elaborates on a particular statement which if uttered implies minor *shirk*. From the perfection of *tawheed* is to avoid the statement 'By the Will of Allah and yours' as it implies setting up rivals to Allah, even if a person utters it unintentionally without thought.
- It may also constitute major *shirk* if a person believes in their heart with conviction that the will of the creation is the same as the ultimate Will of Allah.

عَنْ قَتِيلَةَ: أَنَّ يَهُودِيًّا أَتَى النَّبِيَّ ﷺ فَقَالَ: إِنَّكُمْ تُشْرِكُونَ تَقُولُونَ: مَا شَاءَ اللَّهُ وَشِئْتُمْ وَتَقُولُونَ: وَالْكَعْبَةَ. فَأَمَرَهُمُ النَّبِيُّ ﷺ إِذَا أَرَادُوا أَنْ يَخْلِفُوا أَنْ يَقُولُوا وَرَبِّ الْكَعْبَةِ وَيَقُولُونَ مَا شَاءَ اللَّهُ ثُمَّ شِئْتُمْ. رَوَاهُ النَّسَائِيُّ وَصَحَّحَهُ.

Qutailah narrated: A Jew came to the Prophet ﷺ and said: 'Your people commit shirk when they say: 'By the Will of Allah and yours', and when they say: 'By the Ka'bah.' Thereafter, the Prophet ﷺ commanded the companions to swear by saying: 'By the Lord of the Ka'bah' and to say 'By the Will of Allah and then with your will'. [al-Nasa'i – Sahih]

- **Takhreej:** The *hadith* is narrated in the Sunan of al-Nasa'i. It is graded as authentic (*sahih*), although al-Nasa'i did not mention the authentication in his book, as alluded to by the author.
- **Qutailah:** Bint Sayfi al-Juhaniyya. She was from the female companions who narrated the *hadith* of the Prophet ﷺ.
- (إِنَّكُمْ تُشْرِكُونَ) – "Your people commit shirk". That is, your people O Muhammad ﷺ commit minor *shirk*. The Prophet ﷺ did not rebuke him, although his intention was to criticise him and his companions, because what he said was the truth. This proves the obligation of returning to the truth, even of the one who presents it is not from its people.
- (مَا شَاءَ اللَّهُ وَشِئْتُمْ) – "By the will of Allah and yours". It is minor *shirk* because the conjunction 'and' implies equivalence between the creation and Allah in a matter which is specific to Allah (i.e. His Will).
- (وَالْكَعْبَةَ) – "By the Ka'bah". Because swearing by the creation, no matter how noble, is a form of minor *shirk*.
- How is it that a Jew warned the Muslims about this issue of *tawheed*? No doubt that Allah has knowledge of everything, and His decree contains the ultimate Wisdom. From this Wisdom is that the statement of the Jew is a *hujjah* (excuse) against them, whereby they are critical of the *sahabah* in a matter pertaining to minor *shirk*, yet they are oblivious to the fact that they are immersed in major *shirk*! After the incident, the ruling forbidding this statement was established and the Muslims

complied with it, whereas the Jews remained obstinate upon their major *shirk*. An incident like this cannot be repeated today as the *tashree'* (Islamic legislation) is complete.

- (وَرَبِّ الْكَعْبَةِ) – “By the Lord of the Ka’bah”. Rather than swearing by the Ka’bah which is minor *shirk*, the Prophet ﷺ guided them to swear by Allah, the Lord of the Ka’bah.
- (مَا شَاءَ اللَّهُ ثُمَّ شِدْتِ) – “By the will of Allah then your will”. Because the conjunction ‘then’ implies adherence. That is, the will of the Prophet ﷺ adheres to the Will of Allah and is not equivalent to it.
- **General meaning of the hadith:** A Jewish man came to the Prophet ﷺ intending to criticise Islam and the Muslims. He told the Prophet ﷺ that the Muslims were guilty of minor *shirk* by uttering a certain statement which implies it.

The Prophet ﷺ confirmed what the Jewish man said, and instructed the Muslims to swear only by Allah and to say: ‘By the will of Allah then your will’ rather than ‘By the Will of Allah and yours!’. In doing so, their *tawheed* would become pure and there would be no blemish upon the Muslims which their enemies might exploit.

- **Relevance of the hadith to the chapter:** The *hadith* proves the saying ‘By the Will of Allah and yours’ is a statement which implies minor *shirk*. It is minor *shirk* because the *sahabah* did not intend with it the reality of what it implies. If they did, they would have exited the fold of Islam.

وَلَهُ أَيْضًا عَنْ ابْنِ عَبَّاسٍ، أَنَّ رَجُلًا قَالَ لِلنَّبِيِّ ﷺ: مَا شَاءَ اللَّهُ وَشِئْتُ، فَقَالَ: أَجَعَلْتَنِي لِلَّهِ نَدًّا؟! مَا شَاءَ اللَّهُ وَخَدَّهُ.

Abdullah bin Abbas narrated: Once a man came to the Prophet ﷺ and said: ‘By the Will of Allah and yours’. The Prophet ﷺ said: Have you made me an associate with Allah? Rather it is: ‘By the Will of Allah Alone’. [al-Nasa’i – Hassan]

- **Takhreej:** The *hadith* is narrated by al-Nasa’i, however not in his Sunan al-Sughraa, which is the default reference when al-Nasa’i is quoted. Instead, it is narrated in his al-Sunan al-Kubraa and is graded as sound (*hassan*).
- (أَجَعَلْتَنِي لِلَّهِ نَدًّا) – “Have you made me an associate with Allah!”. The question form is to reprimand. The *sahabi* uttered his statement with the intention of venerating the Prophet ﷺ, yet this did not prevent the Prophet ﷺ from reprimanding him. A ‘*nidd*’ is an equal, that is, have you made me equal to Allah in a matter which is specific to Him (i.e His Will).
- (مَا شَاءَ اللَّهُ وَخَدَّهُ) – “By the Will of Allah Alone”. There is no contradiction between this *hadith* and the previous *hadith* which states ‘By the Will of Allah and then your will’. The statement ‘By the Will of Allah Alone’ is the most complete thing to say, however it is still permissible to say ‘By the Will of Allah then your will’.
- **General meaning of the hadith:** Ibn Abbas informs that a man came to Allah’s Messenger ﷺ and consulted him about a certain matter. After hearing the Prophet’s advice, he said: ‘By the Will of Allah and your will O Messenger of Allah’. The Prophet ﷺ reprimanded him for this statement and explained to him that placing his will besides the Will of Allah was tantamount to setting him up as an equal to Allah. He then guided the man to instead say: ‘By the Will of Allah Alone’, as this statement confirms that the Absolute Will belongs to Allah Alone.
- **Relevance of the hadith to the chapter:** The *hadith* proves that saying ‘By the Will of Allah and your will’ is a statement which implies minor *shirk*. It implies that there is an equal to Allah in His Absolute Will.

وَأَبْنِ مَاجِهَ: عَنِ الطُّفَيْلِ أَحْيَى عَائِشَةَ لِأُمِّهَا قَالَ: رَأَيْتُ كَأَنِّي أَتَيْتُ عَلَى نَفَرٍ مِنَ الْيَهُودِ، قُلْتُ: إِنَّكُمْ لَأَنْتُمْ الْقَوْمُ لَوْلَا أَنْتُمْ تَقُولُونَ: عَزَّيْرُ بْنُ اللَّهِ. قَالُوا: وَأَنْتُمْ لَأَنْتُمْ الْقَوْمُ لَوْلَا أَنْتُمْ تَقُولُونَ: مَا شَاءَ اللَّهُ وَشَاءَ مُحَمَّدٌ. ثُمَّ مَرَرْتُ بِنَفَرٍ مِنَ النَّصَارَى، فَقُلْتُ: إِنَّكُمْ لَأَنْتُمْ الْقَوْمُ لَوْلَا أَنْتُمْ تَقُولُونَ: الْمَسِيحُ ابْنُ اللَّهِ. قَالُوا: وَأَنْتُمْ لَأَنْتُمْ الْقَوْمُ لَوْلَا أَنْتُمْ تَقُولُونَ: مَا شَاءَ اللَّهُ وَشَاءَ مُحَمَّدٌ.

فَلَمَّا أَصْبَحْتُ، أَخْبَرْتُ بِهَا مَنْ أَخْبَرْتُ، ثُمَّ أَتَيْتُ النَّبِيَّ ﷺ فَأَخْبَرْتُهُ، قَالَ: هَلْ أَخْبَرْتَ بِهَا أَحَدًا؟. قُلْتُ نَعَمْ. قَالَ: فَحَمِدَ اللَّهُ، وَأَثْنَى عَلَيْهِ، ثُمَّ قَالَ: أَمَّا بَعْدُ، فَإِنَّ طُفَيْلًا رَأَى رُؤْيَا أَخْبَرَ بِهَا مَنْ أَخْبَرَ مِنْكُمْ، وَإِنَّكُمْ قُلْتُمْ كَلِمَةً كَانَ يَمْنَعُنِي كَذَا وَكَذَا أَنْ أَنْهَأَكُمْ عَنْهَا، فَلَا تَقُولُوا: مَا شَاءَ مُحَمَّدٌ، وَلَكِنْ قُولُوا: مَا شَاءَ اللَّهُ وَحْدَهُ.

al-Tufail, 'Aisha's brother from her mother's side, narrated: I had a dream in which I came upon a group of Jews and said to them: 'You are indeed a good people had you not claimed Uzair to be the son of Allah'. They replied: 'You too are a good people if you did not say: 'By the Will of Allah and the will of Muhammad'.

After that, I came upon a group of Christians and said to them: You are indeed a good people if you do not claim the Messiah to be the son of Allah. They replied: 'You too are a good people if you do not say: 'By the Will of Allah and the will of Muhammad'.

The following morning, I narrated the dream to some people then I went to the Prophet ﷺ and repeated the dream to him. He ﷺ asked: 'Have you told this to anybody else?' I said: 'Yes'. Then he ﷺ went to his pulpit and after praising Allah he said: Tufail had a dream which he has already narrated to some of you. You utter a statement, which due to such and such matter, I was prevented from forbidding you to utter it. However, henceforth, do not say: 'By the Will of Allah and the will of Muhammad', but rather say: 'By the Will of Allah Alone.' [Ibn Majah – Sahih]

- **Takhreej:** The *hadith* is narrated by Ibn Majah in his Sunan and is graded as authentic (*sahih*).
- **al-Tufail:** Ibn Abdullah Ibn Harith. He was the half-brother of A'ishah from her mother, Umm Rumaan. Umm Rumaan was married in the *Jaahiliyya* to Abdullah Ibnul Harith and bore him al-Tufail. After her husband died, she married Abu Bakr al-Siddiq. This is the only *hadith* that al-Tufail narrated, may Allah be pleased with them all.
- (لَوْلَا أَنْتُمْ تَقُولُونَ عَزَّيْرُ بْنُ اللَّهِ) – “Had you not claimed Uzair to be the Son of Allah”. You would be excellent people if you did not commit major *shirk* by claiming that Uzair was the son of Allah.
- (لَوْلَا أَنْتُمْ تَقُولُونَ مَا شَاءَ اللَّهُ وَشَاءَ مُحَمَّدٌ) – “If you did not say ‘By the Will of Allah and the will of Muhammad’”. In the dream of al-Tufail the Jews and the Christians argued with him regarding this statement, which was an act of minor *shirk* committed by some Muslims.
- (لَوْلَا أَنْتُمْ تَقُولُونَ الْمَسِيحُ ابْنُ اللَّهِ) – “If you did not claim the Messiah to be the son of Allah”. The Christians commit major *shirk* by claiming that Isa, the son of Maryam, is the son of Allah, on the basis that he was born without a father.
- (هَلْ أَخْبَرْتَ بِهَا أَحَدًا) – “Have you told anyone else?”. Had he not told anyone, the Prophet ﷺ would have told him to keep it that way. However, when he told him that he had informed others, it became necessary for the Prophet ﷺ to publicise the ruling.
- (كَانَ يَمْنَعُنِي كَذَا وَكَذَا أَنْ أَنْهَأَكُمْ عَنْهَا) – “Which due to such and such matter, I was prevented from forbidding you to utter it”. In another narration of this *hadith*, it mentions that it was modesty which prevented him from forbidding them. That is, modesty before Allah that he should forbid something before the

revelation come down ordering him to forbid it. However, once the revelation descends, then the Prophet ﷺ would never be modest in enjoining the good and forbidding the evil.

- (وَلَكِنْ قُولُوا مَا شَاءَ اللَّهُ وَخُذُوا) – “Rather say: ‘By the Will of Allah Alone’”. He forbade them to say the prohibited statement and made clear to them the permissible alternative.
- **General meaning of the hadith:** In this *hadith* al-Tufail states that he saw a dream in which he passed by a group of Jews and a group of Christians. He praised them both, but also pointed out to them and reprimanded them for the polytheistic acts they commit by assigning sons to Allah. They replied by praising the Muslims, but argued that the Muslims also commit minor *shirk* in some of their utterances whereby they link the Will of Allah with that of the Prophet ﷺ.

The next morning al-Tufail informed a number of people about his dream before eventually going to the Prophet ﷺ and also informing him of it. The Prophet ﷺ then rose and addressed the Muslims in the Masjid. After praising Allah, he ordered them to be strict in their implementation of *tawheed*, particularly concerning Allah’s Will. He told them that he had previously disliked this statement, but he had just been ordered to forbid it, without fear of the truth, regardless of its source.

- **Relevance of the hadith to the chapter:** The *hadith* proves the prohibition of linking Allah’s Will with that of His creation using the conjunction ‘and’, for it implies parity between the two wills and leads to minor *shirk*.

- **Important issues of the Chapter**

1. **The Jews have knowledge of minor shirk.** As per the *hadith* of Qutailah. The Jewish man identified minor *shirk* proving that he had knowledge of it.
2. **A person may understand shirk when it suits them.** As per the *hadith* of Qutailah. The Jewish man reprimanded the Muslims for their minor *shirk*, while being oblivious to their major *shirk*.
3. **The statement of the Prophet ﷺ: ‘Have you made me an associate with Allah?’. How condemnable then is the poet who said: “O noblest of the creatures, there is none for me but you to seek refuge in distress’.** As per the *hadith* of Ibn Abbas. The Prophet ﷺ rebuked the *sahabi* for his excessive praise when he said ‘By the Will of Allah and Yours’. His statement was an act of minor *shirk*. So how about the poet al-Buseery in his *burda* where he blatantly writes poetry containing major *shirk* in the guise of praising the Prophet ﷺ!
4. **This is not major shirk as the Prophet ﷺ said: ‘I was prevented from forbidding you to utter it ...’.** As per the *hadith* of al-Tufail. If it had been major *shirk*, nothing would have prevented him from forbidding it.
5. **A true dream is a kind of revelation.** As per the *hadith* of al-Tufail. It is *wahy* because the Prophet ﷺ exclusively confirmed it.
6. **The sound and true dream may be reason for initiating some rulings in the Shari’ah.** As per the *hadith* of al-Tufail. This is only in the lifetime of the Prophet ﷺ.